IN THE HIGH COURT OF FIJI AT SUVA CIVIL JURISDICTION

Civil Action No.: HBC 296 of 2013

BETWEEN:

B. D. LAKSHMAN & SONS PROPERTIES LTD a limited company

having its registered office at Deuba, Fiji

PLAINTIFF

A N D:

WINSTONE AGGREGATES (FIJI) LTD a limited liability company

having its registered office in Suva, Fiji

1st DEFENDANT

AND:

PASTORAL COMPANY (FIJI) LTD a limited liability company

having its registered office at Raiwaqa, Navua

2nd DEFENDANT

Counsel

Mr. Vinit Singh for the Plaintiff

Mr. P. Sharma for the Second Defendant

Date of Hearing

: 28th of October, 2014,

Date of Ruling

: 15th of April 2015,

RULING

Introduction.

 The Second Defendant (hereinafter referred as the Defendant) filed this application for taxation of cost pursuant to the order made by Justice Mutunayagam on 29th of November 2013.

Background

- 2. The Plaintiff instituted this action by way of a writ of summons against the first and second defendants. However, on 29th of November 2013, the Plaintiff withdrew their claim against the 2nd Defendant. Justice Mutunayagam ordered the cost against the Plaintiff. His lordship further directed that the cost to be taxed if not agreed upon by the parties. Having failed to reach to an agreement for cost, the Defendant filed this application for taxation of cost.
- 3. Having satisfied that the Defendant filed this application within the stipulated time under order 62 r 29 (1), the court issued notice to the Plaintiff and set this application for hearing on the 28th of October 2014. The learned counsel for the Defendant and the Plaintiff made their respective oral submissions during the cause of the hearing. The counsel of the Defendant tendered his written submissions at the conclusion of the hearing. Having considered the bill of cost and respective submissions of the parties, I now proceed with my ruling as follows.
- 4. The learned counsel for the Defendant submitted in his submissions that the Defendant is entitled for indemnity cost as the Plaintiff was informed at the beginning of the proceedings that they have sued a wrong party. The learned counsel for the Plaintiff objected the bill of cost filed by the Defendant on the ground of excessiveness.

5. Order 62 rule 3 states that;

"Where the court makes an order for costs without indicating the basis of taxation or an order that costs be taxed on basis other than the standard basis or the indemnity basis, the costs shall be taxed on the standard basis".

- 6. It appears that the order of Justice Mutunayagam made on 29th of November 2013 has not specified the basis of the taxation of cost. Hence the basis of taxation of this application is the standard basis.
- 7. Order 62 r 12 (1) has provided the basis for taxation, where it states that;
 - "On a taxation of costs on the standard basis there shall be allowed a reasonable amount in respect of all costs reasonably incurred and any doubts which the taxing officer may have as to whether the costs were reasonably incurred or were reasonable in amount shall be resolved in favour of the paying party; and in these rules the term "the standard basis" in relation to the taxation of costs shall be construed accordingly".
- 8. Having considered Order 62 r 13 and the submissions of the parties, I award following cost in respect of the bill of cost filed by the 2nd Defendant.

NO	SCALE	PARTICULARS	COSTS	DISBURSE	ALLOWED BY
				MENTS	TAXING
:					OFFICER
-		INSTRUCT	IONS		
1	4	Receiving instructions from			\$ 120 (cost +
		the 2 nd Defendant by letter			Disbursements)
		dated 29th October 2013			for Items 1 and
		together with the Amended	<u> </u>		2
		Writ of Summons with			
		Statement of Claim; Amended			
		Acknowledgement of Service;			
		Amended Inter-Parte			

			,		
		Summons for Injunction; and	100.00	20.00	
		Amended Plaintiff's Affidavit			
		in Support of Injunction			
		served on behalf of the			
		Plaintiff.			
	1	•	•	1	
		PLEADIN	IGS		
2	4	Preparing, filing and service of			
		Acknowledgement of Service	100.00	11.25	
3	24(a)	Preparing, filing and service of			\$ 207.50
		Statement of Defence of 2 nd	150.00	57.50	(Costs +
		Defendant			Disbursements)
4	24(a)	Preparing, filing and service of			\$ 207.50
		Answering Affidavit of Prith			(Costs +
		Pal Singh to Affidavit of			Disbursements)
		Prince Gopal Lakshman in	150.00	57.50	
		Opposition to injuctive Orders			
		sought by the Plaintiff			
5	26	Preparing Written			\$ 375 (costs +
		Submissions of the 2nd			Disbursements)
		Defendant in Opposition to	400.00	30.00	for items 5,6,7.
		the injunctive Orders sought			
		by the Plaintiff			
6	40	Preparing, filing and service of		11.50	
		Order			
7	31	Receiving instructions for		:	
		taxation of costs. Preparing			:
		filing and service of Bill of	100.00	63.50	
		Costs for Taxation			
		I ETTE	o c		
		LETTER	NO.		
8	40	Letter from R. Patel & Co., to			\$ 150 for items
		Parshotam Lawyers			8 to 12.
	,				

		EMAIL	s	
9	40	Emails dated 28th to 30th October 2013 from R. Patel Lawyers to Mangal Singh; and from Mangal Singh to R. Patel Lawyers		
10	40	Emails dated 06 th November 2013 from R. Patel Lawyers to Mangal Singh; and from Mangal Singh to R. Patel Lawyers		
11	40	Emails dated 07th; 08th; 13th; and 15th November 2013 from R. Patel Lawyers to Mangal Singh		
12	40	Received Notice of Adjourned Hearing from Suva High Court Civil Registry on 14 th November 2013		
		BILL OF C	OSTS	
13	40	Bill of Costs dated 20 th February 2014	:	\$ 75,
		COURT APPEA	ARANCES	
14	24(a)	Appearance in High Court before the Honourable Mr. Justice Mutunayagam on 30th October 2008	150.00	\$ 300 for items 14 to 17.
15	24(b)	Appearance in High Court before the Honourable Mr. Justice Mutunayagam on 13th November 2013	50.00	
16	24(b)	Appearance in High Court		

	1	before the Honourable Mr.	T		
		Justice Mutunayagam on 15th	50.00		
		November 2013	30.00		
17	24(b)	Appearance in High Court	<u> </u>		
		before the Honourable Mr.			
		Justice Mutunayagam on	50.00		
		29th November 2013	;		
		SEARCH	IES		
18	40	Search of B. D. Lakshman &			\$ 300 (Costs +
		Sons (Properties) Ltd at the			Disbursements)
		Registrar of Companies Office		4.15	for items 18 to
		registral of companies office		1.10	26.
19	40	Search of Winstones			
		Aggregates (Fiji) at the		2.40	
		Registrar of Companies Office			
20	40	Search of Pastoral Company			1000
		(Fiji) Limited at the Registrar		4.15	
		of Companies Office			
21	40	Search of the land comprised			
		in Certificate of Title Number			
		25/2494 at the Registrar of		3.00	
:		Titles Office	:		
22	40	Search of the land comprised			
		in Certificate of Title Number			
		25/2495 at the Registrar of		1.80	
		Titles Office			
23	40	Search of the land comprised			
		in Certificate of Title Number		:	
		6021 at the Registrar of Titles		1.20	
		Office			
24	40	Telephone calls		\$20.00	
25	40	 		\$20.00	
		Photocopies Toyi fore to Volume to some	<u> </u>	\$446.00	
26	40	Taxi fare to Vatuwaqa to serve		#10 OC	
		Muskit Law the Solicitors for		\$12.00	

the 1st Defendant		

9. In my conclusion, I award sum of \$ 1,735 as taxed cost to be paid by the Plaintiff to the Defendant within 21 days of this Ruling.

Dated at Suva this 15th day of April, 2015.



R.D.R. Thushara Rajasinghe Master of High Court, Suva